

# Analysis of Vocational Education and Training

## Haiti



**Lyanne Woltjer**

**March 2006**

© 2006 Woord en Daad

This document can be freely copied and distributed under the following conditions:

- The author's name or names has to be included in every copy of this document
- This notice should be included in every copy of this document
- This document should only be copied or distributed as a whole
- This document should not be distributed for profit

# Haiti

## **General**

Haiti is a Presidential Republic, with an interim president: Boniface Alexandre since 17<sup>th</sup> of March 2004. This is a technocratic government which is valued positively in general. The new elections were postponed four times and finally held on the 7<sup>th</sup> of February 2006.

65 % of the population is Catholic, 30 % is Protestant. The majority of the people also practices voodoo.

Over 8 million people live in Haiti.

(Source: CIA, 2006 and Ministerie Buitenlandse Zaken, 2006)

Table: Age categories population Haiti

under 15 years	42,6 %
between 15 and 64 years	53,9 %
Over 65 years	3,4 %

Source: CIA, 2006

The population in Haiti is extremely young: 51,7 % is younger than 20 years (Cordaid, 2005)

## **Economy**

GDP per capita was estimated on 434 USD in 2004 (Min BuZa, 2006), which makes Haiti the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere. 80 % of the population lives in abject poverty (CIA, 2006). Over 65 % of the youth lives in (extreme) poverty; which includes over 3 million children. This leads to a growth in criminal activities. In rural areas there is hardly any distraction, activities or work for these youngsters. What they produce is often after hard work, not very profitable (Cordaid, 2005). The country is being harassed by natural disasters frequently. The Labour force of Haiti consists of 3,6 million people (less than 50 %), with a shortage on skilled labour. There is widespread unemployment and underemployment (CIA Worldfactbook, 2006).

Work is the principal means for social integration. The employment situation is bad in Haiti. Social exclusion is a problem for over 40 % of the people, mainly women (Cordaid, 2005).

Official unemployment rate (registered)	34, 2 %
Unemployment rate 15 – 19 yr olds (	61, 9 %
Unemployment rate 20 – 24 yr olds	50 %
Unprofitable jobs people 20 – 45 yr olds	50 %
Informal job rate of the labour force (2002)	66 %

Source: Cordaid, 2005

The main reasons for difficulties in finding work are:

- the level of education,
- their sex,
- the socio economic status and
- their place of residence (urban/rural).

An improvement of their employability lies in a connection between education and enterprises, vocational education programmes for young and uneducated people and professional orientation service and placement (JBC). It is essential that young people have a sufficient level of education, which is relevant for the current employment range. A series of

skills, which they can use, even in an ever changing demanding employment field. (Cordaid, 2005)

	Share of labour	Share of GDP	
Agricultural sector	66 %	27 %	Small scale subsistence farming, and produces coffee, mangoes, sugarcane, rice, corn, sorghum and wood
Industrial sector	9 %	16 %	sugar refining, flour milling, textiles, cement, light assembly industries
Service sector	25 %	52 %	Service and tourism

Source: CIA Worldfactbook, 2006, IADB, September 2004

Since irregularities with elections in May 2000, many international donors (including EU and USA) have suspended their aid to Haiti. In 2003 this considered 500 million USD. In 2005 the economy declined with 3,5 %. Haiti suffers from a rampant inflation, a lack of investment, and a severe trade deficit. Civil strives and storms further impoverished Haiti in the last 5 years. In early 2005 Haiti paid its arrears to the World Bank, which made many donors resume their aid program. This is still not entering the countries bitter economic problems (CIA Worldfactbook, 2006).

The manufacturing sector accounted for 8 % of GDP in 2003 / 2004, compared with more than 18 % at the beginning of the 1980s. The decline in industrial production is due to military rule, economic sanctions, closure of many offshore assembly plants. Export products are mainly found in garment (85 %). The industrial sector employs 32000 people, which is only 2 % of the formal sector employment. Manufacturing for the domestic market which consists mainly of food and beverage, household goods and building materials has declined since 1994. The only growth was found in public work and construction (Viewshire, 2005).

The informal sector is believed to be growing. In 2004, some 300,000 informal micro enterprises are estimated to employ on average 3 to 4 workers. There is a heavy concentration in trade, employing over half a million informal workers, and services, which is likely to employ close to 300,000 workers. (IADB, May 2005).

The economic impact of the political turmoil and natural catastrophes in 2004 has been significant. While reliable data are unavailable, the 2004 crisis may have worsened the overall poverty situation in Haiti. Low-income households suffered from disruptions in the supply of basic commodities, and the delivery of basic services (education, health, food assistance, security) was severely disrupted in the whole country (IADB, May 2005).

Table: Profile labour force, by education level and sex

CATEGORY	MALE	FEMALE	TOTAL
Total labor force, >15 years (million)	2.2	2.4	4.5
Participation rate (%)	52.3	37.3	44.8
Education levels (%)	100.0	100.0	100.0
None	40.4	53.5	46.2
Primary	32.0	28.2	30.3
Secondary	24.1	16.6	20.8
Postsecondary	3.5	1.7	2.7

Source: IADB, May 2005

## Education

Education standards are extremely low. The World Bank reports that in 2003 the adult literacy rate was just 52%, compared with an average for Latin America and the Caribbean of almost 90 %. There have been various programmes aimed at increasing adult literacy. On returning to office in 1994, Jean Bertrand Aristide extended the education system, and the government in office in 1995 – 2000 continued to prioritise education. There were some improvements in overall primary school attendance, which rose from 20 % in 1994 to a

reported 65 % in 2000. However poverty and lack of resources have acted as constraints on increasing access to education.

School enrolment rates are lowest in rural areas. Only a small minority of children attended secondary school, see table below.

Table: Share of literacy, enrolment, attendance

Adult literacy rate (female rate % ages 15 and above), 2003	50.0
Adult literacy rate (male rate % ages 15 and above), 2003	54
Youth literacy rate (female rate % ages 15-24), 2003	66.5 13
Primary net enrolment ratio (%), 1995	69,4
Primary net enrolment ratio (female %), 1995	69,6
Primary school attendance ratio 1996 – 2004, net, male	52
Primary school attendance ratio 1996 – 2004, net, female	57
Primary drop out rate (age 6 – 11), 1995	3,8
% of primary school entrants reaching grade 5, 1997 - 2004	88
Secondary net enrolment ratio (%), 1995	29,9
Secondary net enrolment ratio (female), 1995	28,9
Secondary school attendance ratio (1996 – 2004), net, male	14
Secondary school attendance ratio (1996 – 2004), net, female	18
% of 15 – 19 year olds with no schooling, 1995	13,6
% of 15 – 19 year olds who have completed primary school, 1995	33,7
Female tertiary gross enrolment ratio (%), 2003 – 2004	..
Tertiary gross enrolment ratio (female), 2003 – 2004	..
Average years of schooling 15 – 24 year olds, 1995	4,8
Average years of schooling 25 +, 1995	2,5

Unicef, *information by country*, 2006 and UNDP, 2005 and World Bank(?), 1995

Lack of income was one of the main reasons that parents do not send their children to school. With 65 % of the population living on less than one US dollar per day, families cannot afford of sending their children to school. Although, public schools at all levels are in theory free, parents are unable to meet the associated costs of items such as uniforms. A national school meals programme and subsidies for uniforms and materials helped to improve access to schools.

The quality of primary education is low, which makes the situation grave. Given the poor state school structure, many parents have to send their children to private schools, both for profit or run by NGOs and churches. A ten year education plan was drawn up in 1997 with the aim of improving public, private and voluntary education service. Lack of resources remain a constraint for progress. (Country profile 2005 Haiti (EIU))

Economicly active boys 10 – 14 yr	10 %
Economicly active girls 10 – 14 yr	8 %

The figures in the table above indicate the extreme poverty in the urban areas, when children have to work instead of going to school (Cordaid, 2005).

The unemployment rate of people with Vocational Education is lower than for other kinds of education.

Table: Unemployment rate by Level of Education Attained

Level of education	Unemployment
Primary	23 %
Secondary	22 %
Vocational	19 %
University	27 %

The labour market pays higher returns to those with higher level of education. Vocational training seems to have a positive effect on the wages

Table: Monthly income from Labour (in Gourdes)

Level of Education Attained	Monthly Income
Less than Primary	1.035
Primary	6.363
Third Cycle	7.482
Secondary	8.358
Vocational Training	22.691
Higher Education	47.682

(Source:?)

Primary school entrance age: 6 years

Primary duration: 6 years

Secondary duration: 7 years

How is VET defined?	“ a comprehensive term referring to those aspects of educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences, and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupation in various sectors of economic and social life. It applies to all forms of technical and vocational education provided in educational institutions or through cooperative programs organized jointly by educational institutions at one hand, and industrial, agricultural, commercial and any other undertaking related to the world of work, on the other.” (UNESCO UNEVOC)
Formal, informal and non formal	There is formal VET integrated in the education system, organised by the government and by NGOs. Formal is within the official government programme. Informal VET is organised by individuals, churches and training on the job. Informal is outside the official government programme. The NGOs and individuals are the main actors in VET. (enquete, Parole & Action, 2006)
% youngsters in vocational education and training, regional differences	
Share of flow from regular education to vocational education and training	
Gender ratio in VET on national level, regional differences	Less than 10 % of the VET students is women. (ca 36 % is womens education (tailor, cuisine, cosmetics). The women who are in this education hardly find a job in their direction. 90 % of the women works in tailoring, embroidery, kitchen, esthetics and bakery.
Which institutions pay attention to VET? (private actors (local NGOs, Churches, private institutions), commercial (organised by trade and industry companies) and public actors)	Government, NGOs, individuals, churches, private institutions
In which regions are they active, share urban / rural?	Mainly urban areas (Parole & Action, enquete, 2006)

### ***Vocational Education and Training***

The high amount of young people in Haiti combined with the low levels of education results in a surge of unexperienced and unskilled jobseekers. These trends are expected to continue, even becoming more pronounced, since the population growth rate remains at 1.9%. (IADB, September 2004).

The lack of skilled labour constitutes a serious constraint to the Haitian assembly industry, which is a growing industry. In a research amongst the enterprises of the seven largest cities, it became clear that there is an unmet demand for 25 specialisations, including plumbing, electronics, refrigeration and cooling systems, agro industry, fishery and construction (IADB, September 2004).

There are three levels of vocational education in Haiti:

- 1) technical vocational education: etablissements d'enseignements technique (EET), which is a scientific level (require 12 years of formal education) and provides theoretical as well as practical education.
- 2) Etablissements d'enseignement professionnel (EEP) (access after six years of formal education) is mainly practical education
- 3) Education for workmen, semi qualified employers is delivered by the Centres de Formation Professionnelle (CFP), in which Centres Menageres (CM) serve as basic education. For this kind of VET no prior level of education is needed (Cordaid, 2005).

During the academic year 2002/2003 slightly over 3,000 students graduated from the public centers. No data are available on the number of students in the non-public centers.

#### **Types of Training Centers**

TRAINING CENTERS	NUMBER OF CENTERS	Market share	PROPORTION PUBLIC
Technical Education Institutes (EET)	45	12,5 %	10%
Vocational Education Schools (EEP)	43	12,5 %	25%
Skills Training Centers (CM)	264	75 %	10%
Total	352	100 %	12 %

(IADB, September 2004).

In data from 1999 Cordaid (2005) has found that there are 440 establishments for VET, which would indicate that the number of VTCs (CM) has decreased. This could be the result of the financial deficiencies of the INFP (see below).

They educated in 1999 29.504 students. 75 % of these were centres for household management for women who rarely end up in skills of workmen. This number is quite low for a country where thousands of young people have problems finding work (Cordaid, 2005). VET is important to the students who cannot afford to go to university (enquete partner Woord en Daad, Feb 2006).

Due to its overwhelming low levels of skilled labour, the informal sector has not managed to adapt to the changing needs of the market, thus making it unable to improve its production methods in recent years. The sector relies mostly on a system of on-the-job training whose impact is limited by the low quality of training of the supervisors who impart skills. The non-public providers encompass everything from rudimentary courses offered in private homes to internationally supported technical training colleges that adhere to strict entry requirements and self imposed quality standards (IADB, September, 2004).

#### **Policy and organisation of VET**

The last 10 years, the Haitian government only spent 3 % of their GNP to vocational education. In the year 2000 48 public establishments are operating under 3 ministries (MENJS (ministry of education youth and sports), MAS (ministry of arts and science), MARNDR). They offer different levels of training: from initial to continuing vocational training going through the specialized training and in alternation with the industry, commerce, agriculture, tourism and handicraft sectors (Cordaid, 2005)

The National Vocational Training Institute (Institut National de Formation Professionnelle, INFP), is a specialized service within the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MENJS). Since the “Decret-Loi de mars 1985: Organisation de la formation professionnelle en Haïti, August 2003”, the INFP is officially the only institution authorized to coordinate and regulate the vocational training system, controlling the quality not only of the centers it operates, but also of all non-public providers of training. The large majority of VTCs operate under the INFP. Since 1997, the INFP has made no investments in equipment, infrastructure, didactic materials, or training of trainers or staff. In 2003/2004, the Government allocated US\$3.9 million to the INFP and the centers it operates, 86% of which is dedicated to salaries. Financial shortages have forced some public providers to rely on donations and unauthorized sale of goods and services to keep centers open.

The new vision of the INFP tries to turn the vocational training more dynamic, modernize the structure and conception of the vocational training, as well as to cover a larger population in a more equitable way. In 2004 the INFP adopted a strategic framework prioritizing the following actions:

- (i) creation of an information and management system;
  - (ii) technical assistance and training to strengthen the supervisory and regulatory capacities of the INFP;
  - (iii) skills upgrading of staff at all levels of the INFP, including teaching staff; and
  - (iv) rehabilitation of equipment and infrastructure of training providers.
- (IADB, September 2005)

The remaining public centers are operated by four different ministries: the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Tourism Secretariat of the Ministry of Commerce, and the Ministry of Public Works (IADB, September 2004).

Necessary reforms, which are already under way in several countries, include

- the separation of vocational preparation from formal secondary education;
- pushing most technical education to the post-secondary level; and,
- overall, making theory more applied, more concrete and more focused on solving problems.

There is a consensus that the region’s current enrolment ratio of ca 30 percent of the cohort will need to be increased significantly, especially through targeting access to the poor (IADB, May 2000).

### ***The main goals on VET in national policy***

The objectives of the National Vocational Training System are:

1. to reinforce the System governance;
2. to improve the workers technical capacity;
3. to improve the quality and efficiency of the training offered;
4. to adequate training to the demand;
5. to assure a certain grade of auto financing of the System

Some of the projects that the INFP contemplates are

1. - the creation of a training and trainer further training centre;
2. - the creation of a network between all the entities of the System;
3. - the reorganization of the Training Centres;
4. - the elaboration of new curriculum giving emphasis on competency based training;
5. - the validation of the professional experience and
6. - the creation of the INFP web site.

These is also a general framework for the development of vocational education; Le Plan National d'Education et de Formation (PNEF). The goal is to redress the education system with sustainable solutions for problems like:

- The inequality of access in schools
- The mediocre level of quality of delivered services
- The weakness of planning and connection between education and work.

One of the main activities suggested in the Plan is to redress the vocational education.

Which can be done by:

- enlarge the access of VET mainly for the poorest,
- connect the VET subjects to the demand of enterprises,
- ensure that qualified teachers are present,
- guarantee a minimum skills quality of public and private employers.

NB. The contents of these activities and their results are unknown to the state sectoral institutions. (Cordaid, 2005)

The national strategy is aimed at strengthening three aspects of the Haitian education system:

- (i) improved governance of the sector;
- (ii) better access to all levels of education, from pre-school to vocational and tertiary education; and
- (iii) enhanced quality of public and non-public education.

To that purpose the project *Basic Education Program* is executed, and is in the process of designing, with the Government, a *Vocational Education Program*, aiming to increase employment opportunities of lowincome youth, and which will be supported by the *TC Quality Control Mechanisms in Vocational Training* (IADB, September 2004).

### ***Relation government and trade and industry (private) companies in VET***

Over 75 % of business and enterprises who are not satisfied with the performance of students, still 85 % of the businesses and enterprises agree that it is better to attract qualified and trained people. Of the newly attracted workforce, only 16 % is a vocational trained worker. Most directors choose adult experiences workers (25 – 30 year). When people finish VET they are ca 20 years old. These 5 years are very difficult to find work and get experienced.

Enterprises find employees via friends and other employers rather than via official channels as JBCs, newspapers and (temporary) employment agencies.

The last 2 years many enterprises (70 %) suffer from a bad economy and hire less staff. 42 % of the companies even thinks about closing down because of the miserable situation.

There are several institutions who have actually closed due to the economic situation (Cordaid, 2005).

---

### ***Relation between governmental and private initiatives on VET***

NA

### ***International donors / INGOs involved in VET***

In general the following INGOs are known to work in Haiti: Amnesty International, CordAid, COHAN- Nederland, Stichting DOEN, Hart voor Haïti, ICCO, Jota Stichting, Justitia et Pax,



Novib, Plan Nederland, KIT, Nederlandse Rode Kruis, Solidaridad, Vereniging van oud-medewerkers van Hôpital Albert Schweitzer, Wereldkinderen en Woord en Daad (Haiti Platform Nederland, 2006).

Haiti works closely with the EU in infrastructure and vocational training (IADB, November 2004, [which is difficult to trace down what program exactly]) World Vision and some Protestant and Catholic Missions (Enquete Parole & Action, enquete, 2006)

### ***Networks around VET***

The vocational training system consists of a very heterogeneous network of institutions training workers aged 15 years and above. Over 350 centers are registered, but hundreds of others operate outside the Government's sphere of influence (IADB, September 2004). Civil society in Haiti is fragmented; there are hardly any branch organisations or platforms (Cordaid, 2005).

### ***Are there examples known of successful and unsuccessful networks?***

NA

### ***(New) initiatives / intentions from the trade and industry (private) sector around VET***

75 % of the VET schools claim not to have any kind of relationship with business and enterprises (Cordaid, 2005).

There were no initiatives found in the private sector to implement VET.

### ***Education of teachers***

63 % of the teachers of VET are ex-students themselves with no more education than their own VET, which they have paid themselves. 50 % of the teachers wishes to have an additional didactic education (Cordaid, 2005).

Haiti has no national training institute for vocational trainers, but relies on a network of providers for the training of trainers, including universities, NGOs and for-profit institutions. The programs often suffer from serious problems in terms of relevance and quality. The trainers that are trained are frequently out of touch with the production sector's needs. Some high-end training institutions depend largely on the productive sector for the recruitment of trainers, which has generally proven to be successful (IADB, September 2004).

### ***VET specialisations***

Percentage of students by VET subject:

	Percentage total
Auto mechanics	10,5
Tailor	12,4
Electrician	14,3
Construction	3,8
Plumbing	6,8
Mechanics	3,9
Furniture making	1,8
Cuisine	15,7
Decoration	2,3
ICT	7,7
Graphic design	3,9
Electronics	2,3
Cosmetics	8,2

Cooling	0,8
Other	15,6

Table: Employees with vocational training by discipline and sex (percent)

School type and specialisation	Male	Female
Manufacturing	97	3
Electricity	100	0
Food Service	100	0
Engineering and Chemistry	82	18
Management and Administration	85	15
Plumbing, Hydraulics and Sanitation	100	0
Secretarial	0	100
Tailor	100	0
Telecommunications	91	9
Air-conditioning	100	0
Carpentry and Woodworking	100	0

Focus in VET and employment should be on:

- Agriculture (still the main motor of the economy)
- Handicrafts (design and more original work, main problem is financing and education)
- Nutrition industry (cycle of production improvement, SME support and development)
- Construction (significant growth in the last years, urbanisation)
- Technology and mechanics (import of technology but no skills to repair etc)

(ADB, September 2004 and May 2005)

### **Strengths and weaknesses**

<b>Strengths</b>	<b>Weaknesses</b>
The government has established an institution (INFP) to coordinate and control VET in Haiti.	Success depends highly on the connection between VET and the labour market (IADB, September 2004). 75 % of the VTCs claim to have no contact with enterprises (Cordaid, 2005)
The last 10 years, new actors have entered the market of VET: NGOs, religious organisations, charitable organisations, congregations and private initiatives (Cordaid, 2005).	Skills don't fit the market, which makes it difficult for graduates to find work. VET doesn't seem to respond well to the needs of the market. The education is rather traditional; not adapted to the world market demands, not adapted to the economy and not demand driven (Cordaid, 2005).
About 310 institutions are private, which are more flexible in reacting to the economic situation (Cordaid, 2005).	A gap in provision of womens skills has to be filled.
Best practices: Haiti tech and CANADO. (IADB, September 2004) Haiti-Tech is an organization that organizes and maintains a vocational/technical school in Haiti, educating over 700 students yearly (stuedu).	Low availability of teachers
Some high-end training institutions depend largely on the productive sector for the recruitment of trainers, which has generally proven to be successful (IADB, September 2004).	Low education of teachers
A plan to reform vocational and technical training and cooperation between the public and private sectors has led to the creation of a technical training centre (Haiti Tech) and a programme for the promotion of	Only 35 % of the students get the opportunity to have a work placement for practice and training. Low share (35 %) of practical education on VTCs, due to

handicrafts (a sector in which Haiti has significant comparative advantages); both of these are now in operation (1999).	
Greater efforts to obtain access to markets in certain developed countries under the various systems of preferential treatment for which Haiti is eligible (Chapter II(5)(v)) should improve manufacturing performance (WTO, 1999).	Low security measures
Measures are being taken, largely under the auspices of the MCI, to enhance the technical skills of the Haitian workforce and to facilitate the transfer of technology (these correspond to the incentives provided under the Investment Code) (WTO, 1999).	Low availability of didactic materials
	Small classrooms
	Most VET educations take 2 to 4 years. For most people this period is too long to remain without income (Cordaid, 2005).
	An estimated 80 % of the Haitian workers don't have access to most VTCs. As a result, only 6 of 1000 workers have a (T)VET diploma. Access to EETs, EEPs and many CMs are restricted to those who have graduated from the formal education system, thus excluding the vast numbers of Haitians with little or no work experience and or incomplete schooling (IADB, September 2004). The base of primary education is limited. The VET is often directed to graduated people (VVO) (Cordaid, 2005)
	The cost of VET is an other constraint for people to attend VET classes mentioned by Parole & Action.
	Low financial resources. TVCs face problems in evaluating the needs and costs (Cordaid, 2005).
	There is an absence of policy and national politics around employment.
	Some regions in the country are too dangerous for NGOs to enter and work in (Cordaid, 2005).
	The government does not do much to improve the status of VET. (Enquete, partner Woord en Daad, 2006)

It may be clear from this scheme that there is a lot to be done on improving the availability of VET in Haiti.

Only 9 % seems to be well prepared for the market after finishing their VET. The reasons why VET students have problems finding work:

- 
- 1) not enough enterprises
  - 2) political instability
  - 3) inflation
  - 4) not enough practice in school
  - 5) not enough quality

(IADB, September 2004).

### **Information sources available**

- UNICEF (2005) info by country
- Viewshire.com
- Visiting report Woord en Daad 2004
- Country report 2005 Haiti (EIU)

- Elaboration d'un plan d'action pour un nouveau programme de formation dynamique et adapte pour des Centres de formation professionnelle. (rapport preliminaire, aug 2005) Cordaid
- Reforming Primary and Secondary Education in Latin America and the Caribbean Inter-American Development Bank, May 2000
- HAITI BANK'S TRANSITION STRATEGY 2005-2006, Inter-American Development Bank November 2004
- Document of the Inter-American Development Bank, HAITI VOCATIONAL TRAINING (HA-0017), Loan Proposal , May 2005
- PROJECT CONCEPT DOCUMENT (PCD) HAITI SEPTEMBER 17, 2004 Project Name: Vocational Training Project number: HA-0017
- Project Concept Document, Haiti, IADB, 17 September 2004
- Questionnaire partner Woord en Daad : Parole & Action, Dr Jacques Jovin, feb 2006
- Country information UNDP <http://hdr.undp.org/statistics/data/countries.cfm?c=BGD>
- Country information Ministry of Foreign Affairs :  
[http://www.minbuza.nl/default.asp?CMS\\_ITEM=4896D88C2DE846B6A0E6FC3E5779E785X3X55948X7](http://www.minbuza.nl/default.asp?CMS_ITEM=4896D88C2DE846B6A0E6FC3E5779E785X3X55948X7)
- Haiti Platform Nederland : <http://www.haitiplatform.nl/index2.html>
- [www.stu.edu](http://www.stu.edu)
- trade policies by sector, Haiti, WT/TPR/S/99/Rev.1, Page 53, WTO,  
[www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/tpr\\_e/s99r1-4\\_e.doc](http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/tpr_e/s99r1-4_e.doc)
-